Fourteenth Loksabha

Session : 8
Date : 22-08-2006
Participants : Malhotra Prof. Vijay Kumar,Malhotra Prof. Vijay Kumar,Singh Shri Arjun,Banerjee Kumari Mamata

an>

Title : Regarding controversy over singing of National Song 'Vande Mataram' in Schools.

… (*Interruptions*)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, 'वन्दे मातरम्' गीत का यह शताब्दी वर्ा है। सात सितम्बर को वन्दे मातरम् गीत अपनाये हुए हमें 100 वर्ा पूरे हो जायेंगे। श्री बंकिम चन्द्र चटर्जी ने जब से यह गीत लिखा, तब से इस गीत ने सारे देश में स्वाधीनता, स्वतंत्रता और राट्रीयता के प्रति राट्र प्रेम पैदा किया है। …(व्यवधान) हजारों क्रान्तिकारी इस गीत को गाते हुए फांसी के फंदे पर झूल गए। यहां पर सबसे ज्यादा आश्चर्य की बात यह है कि …(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह क्या हो रहा है ?

…(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Let me hear.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Vande Mataram is very dear to everybody. I do not know, what is the problem.

… (*Interruptions*)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : अध्यक्ष महोदय, हुआ यह कि श्री अर्जुन सिंह, जो मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्री हैं, उन्होंने यह घो-णा कर दी कि यह गीत स्वैच्छिक है। इस गीत को जो गाना चाहता है, वह गाये और जो नहीं गाना चाहता, वह न गाये। …(व्यवधान)यह राट्र गीत का अपमान है, देश का अपमान है। …(व्यवधान) यह गीत सात सितम्बर को सारे स्कूलों में अनिवार्य रूप से गाया जाना चाहिए। जो लोग इसका विरोध कर रहे हैं, वे राट्र गीत का विरोध कर रहे हैं। राट्र गीत का विरोध करने वाले लोग राट्र के विद्रोही हैं। …(व्यवधान) कल अर्जुन सिंह जी ने जो बात कही, उसे सहन नहीं किया जा सकता। इस देश में राट्र गीत का अपमान सहन नहीं किया जायेगा। जो लोग राट्र गीत को नहीं गाना चाहते, वे देश से जाने के लिए स्वतंत्र हैं। …(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपकी बात पूरी हो गयी है।

…(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing more to be recorded.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: Do you want to say something, Shri Dasmunsi?

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI): Yes Sir.… (*Interruptions*)

यह क्या हो रहा है ? आप लोग मुझे बोलने दीजिए। …(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: You have mentioned it without authority; let him mention now.

… (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Long before the BJP was born, it was the Indian National Congress which recited Vande Mataram song. We do not like to be taught by BJP as to what is the meaning of Vande Mataram. This Parliament sings Vande Mataram and, at that time, irrespective of religion, everybody gets up and salutes. They are trying to build a communal divide which we condemn strongly.… (*Interruptions*)

11.04 hrs.

(At this stage, Shri Chandrakant Khaire and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.)

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Are you showing respect to Vande Mataram? Is this the way to show respect to Vande Mataram?

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 1130 hours.

11.05 hours

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till thirty minutes

past Eleven of the Clock.

---

*Not Recorded.

11.30 hrs.

The Lok Sabha reassembled at thirty minutes past Eleven of the clock

(Mr. Speaker in the Chair)

...(व्यवधान)

Re: Controvercy over singing of National Song 'Vande Mataram' in Schools - contd.

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यहां वंदे मातरम् का प्रश्न हमने उठाया था। यहां अर्जुन सिंह जी बैठे हुए हैं। हम उनसे जानना चाहते हैं कि क्या स्कूलों में इसे गाना कम्पलसरी होगा, मेंडेटरी होगा या नहीं? वंदे मातरम् हमारा राट्रीय गीत है। हम जानना चाहते हैं कि राट्रीय गीत गाना स्वेच्छा से होगा या नहीं? अर्जुन सिंह जी यहां बैठे हुए हैं, उन्हें स्पट करना चाहिए।...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: All right. I cannot force the hon. Minister to respond.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Let us do some business. That will be paying reverence to *Vande Mataram* itself.

... (*Interruptions*)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : इन्हें एपोलोजाइज करना चाहिए।

मोहम्मद सलीम (कलकत्ता-उत्तर पूर्व) : जब यह शुरू हुआ था, तब आप कहां थे...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप सब बैठ जाएं।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Now, he has stood up. I think, he wants to respond. It is entirely for me. Hon. Members, please take your seats.

... (*Interruptions*)

मानव संसाधन विकास मंत्री (श्री अर्जुन सिंह) : आदरणीय अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह बहुत ही खेद का विाय है कि देश के राट्रीय गीत को हम विवाद का विाय बना रहे हैं।...(व्यवधान)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : हम विवाद का विाय नहीं बना रहे हैं।...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय :आप सुनने का धीरज रखें, मंत्री जी आपके कहने पर ही रिस्पाँस कर रहे हैं।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: First, you wanted him to speak; and when he speaks, you do not allow him to speak. What is this?

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You cannot dictate what he should speak. Nobody can dictate to any other Member.

Mr. Minister, it is entirely for you.

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : अध्यक्ष महोदय, वस्तुस्थिति यह है कि प्रधान मंत्री जी ने सभी राजनीतिक दलों की एक समिति बनाई थी। उसमें सभी दलों के अध्यक्ष और नेताओं को नोमिनेट किया था। उस समिति की बैठक हुई थी। उसका उद्देश्य यह था कि देश में अभी से लेकर अगले वर्ा तक कई महत्वपूर्ण घटनाओं को हमें सैलिब्रेट करना था, जैसे 1857 का गदर था, जब देश की आजादी की पहली लड़ाई लड़ी गई थी और फिर भगतसिंह को भी सैलिब्रेट करना था।…(व्यवधान)

मेजर जनरल (सेवानिवृत्त) भुवन चन्द्र खंडूड़ी (गढ़वाल) : 1857 का गदर नहीं था, बल्कि आजादी की प्रथम लड़ाई थी।…(व्यवधान)

मोहम्मद सलीम : आपको भगतसिंह के सैलिब्रेशन में क्या आपत्ति है…(व्यवधान) आपने रामप्रसाद बिस्मिल की सेंटेनरी भी नहीं मनाई, भगतसिंह की तो मनाने दीजिए।…(व्यवधान) हम मनाएंगे…(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please allow him to speak.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: If you do not listen to the hon. Minister, I would ask him not to respond.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nobody has patience to hear others. It is unfortunate.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have not allowed anything else to go on record. Please take your seats. Let the hon. Minister speak.

(Interruptions) *

मोहम्मद सलीम : क्या आप लोगों ने ही राट्रभक्ति का ठेका ले रखा है…(व्यवधान)

---

* Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: I would earnestly request all the hon. Members to please take their seats. It is a matter relating to *Vande Mataram.* I have myself observed.

… (*Interruptions*)

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE (CALCUTTA SOUTH): Sir, they are not allowing their own Minister to speak… (*Interruptions*)

मोहम्मद सलीम : इन्हें एपोलोजाइज़ करना पड़ेगा। इन्हें क्या अधिकार है और इनकी क्या ताकत है, ये हमें राट्रद्रोही नहीं बोल सकते।…(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I have said, it is one of the precious songs of our country. Everybody knows the structure.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: This is not proper. Please do not disturb. Please take your seats.

Please take your seat.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Only, the hon. Minister's statement will be recorded.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will be recorded.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: No, I would not allow anything. Only the hon. Minister's statement will be recorded.

*(Interruptions) **

MR. SPEAKER: No, Md. Salim, please take your seat.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: No, Mr. Acharia, please take your seat.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: All of you please take your seats. You wanted the Minister to respond.

… (*Interruptions*)

---

*Not Recorded.

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seats.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing is being recorded.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: They will be deleted. All those words will be deleted. Nothing is being recorded.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing will be recorded.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: All of you please sit down. Let us not be impatient of each other. All are hon. Members of this House. All of us have taken the pledge of upholding the Constitution which is the highest law of this country. That means, we have accepted it. Every one of us has accepted it. All of us, who are worthy and hon. Members of this House, have accepted it. Let us not be disrespectful to each other.

You have raised an issue. The hon. Minister is responding. Let him respond. Please listen to him. If you want to say anything, there are methods of raising it. You give notice. If you want to have a discussion, I will allow it. But if you do not listen to each other, we cannot proceed.

Now, the hon. Minister will speak. Only his statement will be recorded.

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं सदन से निवेदन कर रहा था कि माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी के नेतृत्व में जो सर्वदलीय बैठक हुई थी, उसमें माननीय आडवाणी जी भी थे। उस बैठक में यह निर्णय लिया गया कि…(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: He wants to dictate to the Minister. What will you say?

… (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मिनिस्टर को सुनिये। आप लोग अगर नहीं जानते, तो हम क्या करें।

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: If he is not speaking the truth, you can pull him up for contempt.

---

*Not Recorded.

श्री अर्जुन सिंह : उस बैठक में निर्णय लिया गया, इन वायों को लेकर, कि इसकी शताब्दी या किसी का साठवां वर्ा जब आता है, वह देश को मनाना है। उसी में वंदे-मातरम् के संबंध में चर्चा हुई और वंदे-मातरम् का सौवां वर्ा मनाने का फैसला किया गया। उसी फैसले के तहत, 7 सितम्बर को, जब इसके 100 वर्ा पूरे होते हैं, उस समय क्या करना है, यह विाय कल्चरल डिपार्टमेंट के सामने आया। उन्होंने मुझसे कहा कि वंदे मातरम् को मनाने का सबसे अच्छा तरीका यह है कि देश के अंदर सब लोग सामूहिक रूप से इसका गायन करें। इसलिए मैंने देश के सभी मुख्यमंत्रियों के लिखकर भेजा कि 7 तारीख को ऐसे आयोजन हर जगह होने चाहिए। इसमें क्या गलती है?…(व्यवधान) अब सवाल यह है कि मैंने किसी से यह नहीं कहा कि किसी को जबर्दस्ती उसमें शामिल करना है, जो शामिल होता है, वह गाये, इसमें किसको एतराज है।…(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: All right, now let us take up the Question Hour.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Let us go on with the work. Question Hour is very important.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: If you want, you give notice for any discussion. You give a notice. You give some notice and I will see it.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : What has been said is that Centenary of *Vande Mataram* is going to be observed this year on the 7th of September.

… (*Interruptions*)

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा : अध्यक्ष जी, इसमें जबरदस्ती का क्या मामला है? कल को राट्रगान के बारे में कहेंगे, देश के संविधान के बारे में कहेंगे…(व्यवधान) इस के प्रोटेस्ट में, हम श्री अर्जुन सिंह के वक्तव्य का विरोध करते हैं। उन्हें माफी मांगनी चाहिए। उन्होंने देश का अपमान किया है, इस पर कार्यवाही होनी चाहिए। इसके विरोध में हम सदन से वाकआउट करते हैं।

11.41 hrs.

(Prof. Vijay Kumar Malhotra and some other hon.

Members then left the House)

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : You cannot do like that. This is not the time for discussion on it.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Let us proceed with the Question Hour.

… (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय :आपकी कोई बात सुनने में नहीं आ रही है।

…(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing is being recorded.

*(Interruptions)**

अध्यक्ष महोदय :कृपया आप बैठ जाइए। Let us take up Q. No. 361. आपने अपनी बात कह दी है।

…(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER : You have made your point.

… (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय :आप अध्यक्ष जी बोल रहे हैं। अध्यक्ष जी क्या करेंगे? अध्यक्ष जी को कुछ करना नहीं हैं। आप कुछ सुनते भी नहीं हैं। हमने कहा है कि if you want to discuss it, then you give notice. If you do not like the hon. Minister's statement, you have a proper discussion. I have never stopped it.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing will be recorded.

(Interruptions) *

MR. SPEAKER : I have said from the Chair that *Vande Mataram* is part of India's ethos, India's struggle for freedom. Everybody respects *Vande Mataram.* There is nobody who has not done it.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing is to be recorded.

(Interruptions) *

MR. SPEAKER : Please cooperate. There are very important Questions. Your matter has been raised and the hon. Minister has responded.

… (*Interruptions*)

---

*Not Recorded.

अध्यक्ष महोदय :श्री चौबे, आप अपनी सीट पर जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER : It is very very unfortunate.

… (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप लोग बैठ जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER : It is very unfortunate that even *Vande Mataram* is made a matter of confrontation. This is very unfortunate.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot hear anything.

… (*Interruptions*)

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, Vande Mataram is our National Song. … (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI): Sir, they are defying the leadership of Prof. Malhotra! … (*Interruptions*) They have not responded to his walk-out call! … (*Interruptions*) Prof. Vijay Kumar Malhotra's leadership has been defied by them! … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have more than once today …

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. What are you doing?

… (*Interruptions*)

प्रो. रासा सिंह रावत (अजमेर) :अध्यक्ष महोदय, वंदे मातरम भारतीय संविधान का प्रतीत है । यह इसका अपमान कर रहे हैं ।… (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदयः आप बैठ जाइए ।

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. I will take action against you.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Athawale, sit down.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have always been requesting that in an important matter, certainly it is my duty to give you an opportunity to raise it. Here, I had requested that you will be allowed to raise it at 12 o'clock, but you have raised it now. I have already observed more than once that nobody can diminish the importance of Vande Mataram in this country.

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : He has done it.

MR. SPEAKER: No, he has not done it. It is not fair.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You raised the matter. You wanted the Minister to respond. I did not ask him. He himself volunteered to respond. He has responded. He has said that Vande Mataram centenary will be observed throughout the country. The Government has taken a decision. There is no question of disrespect to Vande Mataram. Please allow the House to function now. What more do you want?

… (*Interruptions*)

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE : Mr. Speaker, please allow me for one minute only. … (*Interruptions*)

Sir, I am also grateful to the Government that they have nominated me as a member of the Committee, but I was not informed about the venue of the meeting.

Sir, I only wanted to add that Vande Mataram is our National Song. It does not matter who has written it. … (*Interruptions*) It may be Iqbal; it may be Bankim Chandra … (*Interruptions*) Sir, you control your Members first. This is too much. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Everybody is controlled! I will put you in the Chair to control the House!

… (*Interruptions*)

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE : Sir, Vande Mataram is our National Song. … (*Interruptions*) Our Rashtra Gaan is written by Rabindra Nath Tagore. Sir, we respect it and everybody respects it. I think, there should not be any controversy. … (*Interruptions*) When Iqbal has written Saare Jahaan Se Achchha Hindustan Hamara, we do not think who has written it, whether he is a Hindu or a Muslim. We love this song. We love Vande Mataram. We love Jana Gana Mana. We love Saare Jahaan Se Achchha Hindustan Hamara. So, there should not be any controversy about this. We have the highest regard for our National Song, National Anthem and Saare Jahaan Se Achchha. I will request the House not to divide like this because we have to respect the sentiments, the emotions, the integration, the unity and the secularism of our country. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Now, this cannot be prolonged.

श्री अनंत गंगाराम गीते (रत्नागिरि) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह वंदे मातरम् और आजादी की जंग का अपमान है…(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Do not record. Not one word will be recorded except Shri Sugrib Singh's supplementary on Q. No. 361.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: Are you doing justice? Are you showing respect to Vande Mataram by doing this?

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Salim, please take your seat.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: All of you please take your seats. Shri Sugrib Singh.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Members, do you want the House to run or not? If you do not wish the House to run, then let us go back home.

… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: The people of this country will decide.

… (*Interruptions*)

---

*Not Recorded.

(SN Q. 1)

SHRI UDAY SINGH : Sir, I would like to first profusely thank you for allowing this Short Notice Question. This is an important Question. The inaction on part of the Government was bizarre as it is, but after I have received this reply from the Minister, the situation has become ridiculous. This is a 7,000-crore rupee industry on which lakhs of people are dependent for their livelihood. We have seen in the past one month, since the CSE report came out, that various State Governments have taken action on their own. There have been some State Governments which have banned the production and the distribution of soft drinks. Others have gone half way through it, but the Union Government does not seem to be coming out with any clear policy.

Sir, the since the last report came out in 2002 or 2003, a high-powered JPC was set up, and the JPC gave certain recommendations. The BIS also finalised the standards for soft drinks to be followed in the country, but that has not been notified. In fact, on the day of the last meeting of the

BIS, when the standards were to be notified, the Union Health Secretary, God knows on whose instructions, wrote to the BIS to hold back the action. There is a total confusion.

MR. SPEAKER: Please ask your supplementary.

SHRI UDAY SINGH : Sir, is the Central Government likely to take an action shortly which will clear the confusion that exists today because the health of millions of people is at stake?

MR. SPEAKER: Are you going to make your position clear?

DR. ANBUMANI RAMADOSS: Definitely, we are very much concerned about the situation prevailing today on the pesticide issue, after the reports submitted by the CSE. We are setting standards, after the JPC recommendations. To set the standards, we have to go through detailed scientific studies. There are three main standards which we have to set: one for water, one for sugar content, and one for the concentrate. There are three different products in a carbonated drink. In respect of setting standards for a carbonated drink, in fact, India was one of the first countries to set it way back in 1955. Pertaining to the current issue, already there are standards for water. The standard for packaged drinking water is the standard set for water to be used in the manufacturing of carbonated drinks.

Coming to the standards for sugar, we have been testing these things. By January, 2007, maybe, in three to four months time, we will be having comprehensive standards for all the specifications of a carbonated drink. Sugar standards will be given because we have to go through a process of scientific testing and validating which would stand in a court of law. The Head of ICMR, Dr. Ganguly, has been heading a high-level Committee which has been going into the issue. Coming to the third part, the concentrate part, this is a patented proprietary item, and the onus of having no pesticides in the concentrate is on the manufacturers.

Even though the standards will be set shortly, according to the current prevalent situation there should not be any pesticide residue in any of the carbonated drinks. We have standards of minimum residue of pesticide in soft drinks.

To answer the hon. Member, we are in the process of setting standards for these carbonated drinks shortly.

SHRI UDAY SINGH : Sir, the reply of the Minister practically trashes the Report of the CSE. On every count it says that it is not found to be true. I did not want to say it so directly but I think there is... *(Not recorded)* between the Government and the soft-drink manufacturers and, therefore, I think setting up… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will see to it. Do not use that word. Strong words break no bones.

SHRI UDAY SINGH : All right, Sir, I withdraw that word and put it in softer words.

MR. SPEAKER: No, I do not want softer words. You may put it in parliamentary words.

SHRI UDAY SINGH : The Government's inaction in this regard is giving rise to the suspicion in our minds. Committees after committees have been set up. There is no need for setting so many committees. Either the Report of the CSE is right, in which case the soft drinks, as they stand today, must be banned or the Report of the CSE is wrong, in which case the State Governments be advised that a ban on the soft drinks must be stopped.

MR. SPEAKER: You are giving suggestions. You may put the supplementary. You are articulate enough. Please put the question.

SHRI UDAY SINGH : Sir, I would like to know the concrete time frame by when the Union Government will come out with a clear-cut policy because giving shifting dates of January next year or May next year will not work. We have already seen so many years gone by. I would like to know from the Government, from the hon. Minister, the specific date by when this would be done.

DR. ANBUMANI RAMADOSS: Sir, the hon. Member has used some strong words.

MR. SPEAKER: Those have been omitted. Why do you worry?

DR. ANBUMANI RAMADOSS: Even though they have been omitted, I would like to say that the intention of the Government is consumer-safety. Consumer-safety is my priority. I have stated in my answer that we are not contradicting the CSE Report. The Report is inconclusive and that is why we have asked the CSE for more details. The interpretation of the specialists on the CSE Report is already in the website. Anybody can go into the website and see the interpretation of the Report of the CSE. We have asked the CSE for more information. When they will elicit information, we will go into the issue again. It is not that the CSE Report is right or wrong. Currently, it is inconclusive and we need more details of the Report. It is a matter of few days only when we are going to have more conclusive Report of the CSE.

Coming to the Committee, it has to go through the process of law. Acting in a haste will not solve any of the problem today. Whatever we do, we have to do it scientifically. It is not that the Committee is just going on and on. Whatever we do, it has to stand in a court of law. We are trying to do it scientifically.

SHRI UDAY SINGH : Sir, I am not satisfied with the reply. This was the most unsatisfactory reply. … (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: No, I would not allow you further.

Shri Francis George – Not Present.

SHRI RAYAPATI SAMBASIVA RAO : Sir, the CSE Study Report sates that the pesticide residue in soft drink samples collected from different States of India is on an average 24-times above the Bureau of Indian Standards. While the test done on soft drinks samples from the United States show no pesticide residue. Why this difference is there? Why are they producing the soft drinks in India with pesticide residue above certain level and why are they not doing the same in the United States and other countries? Why are we allowing them to do the same?

DR. ANBUMANI RAMADOSS: Sir, firstly, I would like to thank the CSE, Ms. Sunita Narayan, for brining up this issue not only for the general public of the country but for the Government also. She is a good friend. I have already said that the CSE Report is inconclusive and we are getting more information on it. It is already there on the website. We are now waiting for the CSE final Report. We have also asked the State Governments to pick up more samples and today more than 200 samples, literally from 14 States, of these carbonated drinks and the carbonated water, which is used in the manufacture of these carbonated drinks, have been lifted.

The process is going on. We have results from a laboratory from Gujarat which says that there are no pesticide residues in the drinks. It is a high level laboratory. The Central Food Laboratory, Mysore, which is a NAB accredited laboratory lifted four samples from the local retail market. They have also said that there are no pesticide residues above permissible limits. Notwithstanding that, we have to wait for all the results to come and we have to go through a process and protocol of testing. These laboratories are going through the protocol of Prevention of Food Adulteration Act. These are the laboratories which will be evaluated in the court of law… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: This is a very bad habit.

श्री पारसनाथ यादव : माननीय अध्यक्ष जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय मंत्री जी से एक सवाल पूछना चाहता हूं। माननीय मंत्री जी ने उत्तर दिया है कि सीएसई ने "शीतल पेयजलों में पैस्टिसाइड अवशिट का विश्लेाण" नामक एक रिपोर्ट जारी की है। शीतल पेयजलों का उद्योग आजकल शहरों के अलावा ग्रामीण अंचलों में भी बहुत तेजी से चल रहा है। इस रिपोर्ट से यह उद्योग प्रभावित हुआ है। इसी विाय में यह सवाल उठा था और सवाल के उत्तर में, माननीय मंत्री जी के लंबे चौड़े उत्तर के बाद भी अनिश्चितता की स्थिति बनी हुई है। मंत्री जी अभी भी एक कमेटी का गठन कर रहे हैं, जिसकी अध्ययन रिपोर्ट जनवरी, 2007 में आएगी। 2007 में आने वाली रिपोर्ट में अभी काफी समय है। तब तक के लिए मेरा माननीय मंत्री जी से सीधा सवाल है कि जब तक यह रिपोर्ट न आए कि यह पेयजल स्वास्थ्य के लिए ठीक हैं या नहीं, तब तक के लिए क्या मंत्री जी इन शीतल पेयों पर प्रतिबंध लगाने जा रहे हैं या नहीं, क्योंकि आज ग्रामीण अंचलों में छोटे-छोटे दुकानदार भी इन पेयजलों को रख रहे हैं और यह उद्योग बहुत प्रभावित हो रहा है।

MR. SPEAKER: He has already answered elaborately. एक ही उत्तर आप मांगते हैं।

DR. ANBUMANI RAMADOSS: Sir, I am more worried about the consumer safety. As regards the issue of pesticide residues, today the onus is on the manufacturers that there should not be any pesticide residues above the permissible limits in any of these carbonated drinks. Today, there are standards. It is not that standards are not there. We are trying to work on comprehensive standards and by early 2007, it is going to come but even today it is not that there are no standards and the manufacturers can put any amount of contaminants in any of these things. It is not like that. In fact, we have a set of standards for water, concentrates and sugar also. *Prima facie*, the preliminary study says that there are no pesticide residues in sugar also. So, ultimately the manufacturers of carbonated drinks should not have any pesticide residues even today above maximum permissible limit. We have a set of standards today also. It is not that we have to wait for 2007 and the onus is on the manufacturers.

I would like to mention that we are discussing two issues. One is the pesticides issue and the second is the health issue. The health is the larger issue. I would like to inform the House that in future, we are going to have a lot of problems on the health issue due to all the junk foods including

the carbonated drinks. Today the health studies are there which say that these so called drinks cause obesity in children, lead to diabetes, dental problems and bone problems which lead to fracture. These are some of the health issues where there have been global studies. We have to take a comprehensive decision on the health issue… (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Do not respond to any and every question.

… (*Interruptions*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप मेहरबानी करके बैठ जाइए।

...(व्यवधान)

श्री रवि प्रकाश वर्मा : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आपका आभारी हूं कि आपने मुझे भी इस प्रश्न पर सप्लीमेंटरी पूछने का मौका दिया। कोल्ड बिवरेजेस में पेस्टीसाइड का मामला कितना संवेदनशील है, इसे आप भी जानते हैं। जिस दिन यह मामला सदन के फ्लोर पर उठाया गया था, उस दिन लगभग सभी पार्टियों की तरफ से एकजैसी प्रतिक्रिया हुई थी। उसके बाद से पूरे हिन्दुस्तान में इसके खिलाफ आंदोलन चलाए जा रहे हैं। लोगों को यह महसूस हो रहा है कि सरकार ने उन्हें छला है। आज उसे तीन साल हो गए हैं, जेपीसी की रिपोर्ट भी आ चुकी है, उसके हिसाब से ब्यूरो ऑफ इंडियन स्टैंडर्ड्स ने भी नये स्टैंडर्ड ले-आउट कर लिए हैं, क्या कारण है कि सरकार उन्हें नोटीफाई करने से रोक रही है?

अध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे इस बारे में कोई शंका नहीं है, जैसा अभी उदय सिंह जी ने यह बात कही थी कि जनमानस को ये सवाल उद्वेलित कर रहे हैं कि सरकार की जवाबदेही जनता के प्रति है, इस संसद के प्रति है या कोल्ड ड्रिंक्स, कोला मैनेजमैंट के प्रति है, मंत्री जी को आज यह बात संसद के अंदर साफ कर देनी चाहिए। अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आज यही बात आपके माध्यम से स्पट पूछना चाहता हूं...(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय :यह भााण का टाइम नहीं है, प्रश्न पूछने का टाइम है। आप प्रश्न पूछिए।

श्री रवि प्रकाश वर्मा : मंत्री जी क्लियर नहीं कर रहे हैं। मंत्री जी ने कहा है कि हम और समय लेना चाहते हैं। यहां हमारे सभी सहयोगी सांसद बैठे हैं। उनकी भावनाओं को ध्यान में रखते हुए मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि जब तक सेफ्टी रिपोर्ट क्लियर नहीं होती, तब तक के लिए हिन्दुस्तान के अंदर कोला की सेल बैन हो जानी चाहिए, क्या मंत्री जी ऐसा करना चाहते हैं या नहीं?

DR. ANBUMANI RAMADOSS: Sir, after the report of the JPC, a national level Expert Committee to advise the Central Committee on Food Standards on the issue of pesticides residues not only in carbonated drinks but also in fruit juices had been formed. This Committee comprised of Dr. Ganguly, the DG, ICMR, Dr. Khanna, a retired Director of the Industrial Toxicology Research Centre, Lucknow, Dr. Agnihotri of Agricultural Research Institute and Dr. Thyagarajan, ex-Director of Indian Institute of Chemical Technology, Hyderabad. It was a high level Committee. They had comprehensively gone into the issues of pesticides residues not only in carbonated drinks but also in fruit juices.

Sir, it is not a question of banning or not banning the soft drinks. Under Section VII of the PFA, any State Government can take action if any food product is found to be detrimental to the health of its citizens. But if such a decision is taken, then that would only be a short-term measure. That is why I would like to say that if we were to take any decision, then we need to take it on health grounds. The issue of pesticides residue is a short-term problem. The health issue is going to be a long-term problem. The sugar concentrate in the soft drinks is more dangerous than the pesticides

content in the soft drinks. Literally, there is five to ten per cent of sugar content in the soft drinks. That is why I am saying that we need to take a decision on the health grounds. The Government is not dithering on the issue. We are very concerned about it. The whole country is looking towards the Government on this issue. We are concerned about consumer safety. It is not as if we are not taking any decision… (*Interruptions*)